Counting the citations: a comparison of Web of Science and Google Scholar in the field of business and management

Authors: John Mingers and Evangelia Lipitakis

01 Nov 2010

Abstract:

Assessing the quality of the knowledge produced by business and management academics is increasingly being metricated. Moreover, emphasis is being placed on the impact of the research rather than simply where it is published. The main metric for impact is the number of citations a paper receives. Traditionally this data has come from the ISI Web of Science but research has shown that this has poor coverage in the social sciences. A newer and different source for citations is Google Scholar. In this paper we compare the two on a dataset of over 4,600 publications from three UK Business Schools. The results show that Web of Science is indeed poor in the area of management and that Google Scholar, whilst somewhat unreliable, has a much better coverage. The conclusion is that Web of Science should not be used for measuring research impact in management.

References

Allen, D.E. and Powell, R. (2013). The fluctuating default risk of Australian banks. Australian Journal of Management, 37, pp. 297–325.
View
Web of Science®
Google Scholar
Allenby, B. and Fink, J. (2005). Toward inherently secure and resilient societies. Science, 309, pp. 1034–1036.
View
CAS
PubMed
Web of Science®
Google Scholar
Avey, J.B., Luthans, F. and Jensen, S.M. (2009). Psychological capital: a positive resource for combating employee stress and turnover. Human Resource Management, 48, pp. 677–693.
View
Web of Science®
Google Scholar

Avey, J.B., Reichard, R.J., Luthans, F. and Mhatre, K.H. (2011). Meta-analysis of the impact of positive psychological capital on employee attitudes, behaviors, and performance. Human Resource Development Quarterly, 22, pp. 127–152.
View
Web of Science®
Google Scholar
Avey, J.B., Wernsing, T.S. and Luthans, F. (2008). Can positive employees help positive organizational change? Impact of psychological capital and emotions on relevant attitudes and behaviors. Journal of Applied Behavioral Science, 44, pp. 48–70.
View
Web of Science®
Google Scholar
Bandura, A. (1997). Self-Efficacy: The Exercise of Control. New York, NY: Freeman.
View
Web of Science®
Google Scholar
Bergheim, K., Eid, J., Hystad, S.W., Nielsen, M.B., Mearns, K., Larsson, G. and Luthans, B. (2013). The role of psychological capital in perception of safety climate among air traffic controllers. Journal of Leadership & Organizational Studies, 20, pp. 232–241.
View
Web of Science®
Google Scholar
Block, J. and Kremen, A.M. (1996). IQ and ego-resiliency: conceptual and empirical connections and separateness. Journal of Personality and Social Psychology, 70, pp. 349–361.
View
CAS
PubMed
Web of Science®
Google Scholar
Boin, A. and Hart, P. (2010). Organizing for effective emergency management: lessons from research. Australian Journal of Public Administration, 69, pp. 357–371.
View
Web of Science®
Google Scholar

Boone, C.A., Craighead, C.W., Hanna, J.B. and Nair, A. (2013). Implementation of a system approach for enhanced supply chain continuity and resiliency: a longitudinal study. Journal of Business Logistics, 34, pp. 222–235.
View
Web of Science®
Google Scholar
Börner, K., Chen, C. and Boyack, K. (2003). Visualizing knowledge domains. Annual Review of Information Science and Technology, 37, pp. 179–255.
View
Web of Science®
Google Scholar
Brandon-Jones, E., Squire, B., Autry, C.W. and Petersen, K.J. (2014). A contingent resource-based perspective of supply chain resilience and robustness. Journal of Supply Chain Management, 50, pp. 55–73.
View
Web of Science®
Google Scholar
Branzei, O. and Abdelnour, S. (2010). Another day, another dollar: enterprise resilience under terrorism in developing countries. Journal of International Business Studies, 41, pp. 804–825.
View
Web of Science®
Google Scholar
Brown, A.G. (1993). High reliability organizations: a review and critique of the Berkeley group. Templeton Management Research Paper MRP/93/9, 1993.
Google Scholar
Bullough, A., Renko, M. and Myatt, T. (2014). Danger zone entrepreneurs: the importance of resilience and self-efficacy for entrepreneurial intentions. Entrepreneurship Theory and Practice, 38, pp. 473–499.
View
Web of Science®
Google Scholar
Burnard, K. and Bhamra, R. (2011). Organizational resilience: development of a conceptual framework for organizational responses. International Journal of Production Research, 49, pp. 5581–5599.
View

Web of Science®
Google Scholar
K.S. Cameron, J.E. Dutton and R.E. Quinn (eds) (2003). Positive Organizational Scholarship: Foundations of a New Discipline. San Francisco, CA: Berrett-Koehler.
Google Scholar
Campbell, D.T. (1965). Variation and selective retention in socio-cultural evolution. In H.R. Barringer, G.I. Blanksten and R. Mack (eds), Social Change in Developing Areas. Cambridge, MA: Schenkman, pp. 19–49.
View
Google Scholar
Campbell, D.T. (1969). Variation and selective retention in socio-cultural evolution. General Systems, 14, pp. 69–85.
Web of Science®
Google Scholar
Carpenter, S., Walker, B., Anderies, J.M. and Abel, N. (2001). From metaphor to measurement: resilience of what to what? Ecosystems, 4, pp. 765–781.
View
Web of Science®
Google Scholar
Chen, J., Chen, T.H.Y., Vertinsky, I., Yumagulova, L. and Park, C. (2013). Public–private partnerships for the development of disaster resilient communities. Journal of Contingencies and Crisis Management, 21, pp. 130–143.
View
Web of Science®
Google Scholar
Christopher, M. and Peck, H. (2004). Building the resilient supply chain. International Journal of Logistics Management, 15, pp. 1–14.
View
Google Scholar
Coutu, D.L. (2002). How resilience works. Harvard Business Review, 80, pp. 46–55.
PubMed
Web of Science®
Google Scholar
Craighead, C.W., Blackhurst, J., Rungtusanatham, M.J. and Handfield, R.B. (2007). The severity of supply chain disruptions: design characteristics and mitigation capabilities. Decision Sciences, 38, pp. 131–156.

View
Web of Science®
Google Scholar
Cumming, G.S., Barnes, G., Perz, S., Schmink, M., Sieving, K.E., Southworth, J., Binford, M., Holt, R.D., Stickler, C. and Van Holt, T. (2005). An exploratory framework for the empirical measurement of resilience. Ecosystems, 8, pp. 975–987.
View
Web of Science®
Google Scholar
Davies, A. and Thomas, R. (2003). Talking cop: discourses of change and policing identities. Public Administration, 81, pp. 681–699.
View
Web of Science®
Google Scholar
Dollwet, M. and Reichard, R. (2014). Assessing cross-cultural skills: validation of a new measure of cross-cultural psychological capital. International Journal of Human Resource Management, 25, pp. 1669–1696.
View
Web of Science®
Google Scholar
Dongsheng, Z., Weijiong, Z., and Vertinsky, I. (2002). Advertising trends in urban China. Journal of Advertising Research, 42, pp. 73–81.
View
Google Scholar
Farjoun, M. (2010). Beyond dualism: stability and change as a duality. Academy of Management Review, 35, pp. 202–225.
View
Web of Science®
Google Scholar
Farjoun, M. and Starbuck, W.H. (2007). Organizing at and beyond the limits. Organization Studies, 28, pp. 541–566.
View
Web of Science®
Google Scholar
Fiksel, J., Polyviou, M., Croxton, K.L. and Pettit, T.J. (2015). From risk to resilience: Learning to deal with disruption. MIT Sloan Management Review, 56, pp. 79–86.
Web of Science®

Google Scholar
Garfield, E. (2004). Historiographic mapping of knowledge domains literature. Journal of Information Science, 30, pp. 119–145.
View
Web of Science®
Google Scholar
Gittell, J.H., Cameron, K., Lim, S. and Rivas, V. (2006). Relationships, layoffs, and organizational resilience: airline industry responses to September 11. Journal of Applied Behavioral Science, 42, pp. 300–329.
View
Web of Science®
Google Scholar
Hamel, G. and Valikangas, L. (2003). The quest for resilience. Harvard Business Review, 81, pp. 52–65.
PubMed
Web of Science®
Google Scholar
Hiles, A. (2008). The Definitive Handbook of Business Continuity Management. 2nd edn. Chichester: John Wiley.
Google Scholar
Hopkins, A. (1999). The limits of normal accident theory. Safety Science, 32, pp. 93–102.
Web of Science®
Google Scholar
Janssen, M.A. (2007). An update on the scholarly networks on resilience, vulnerability, and adaptation within the human dimensions of global environmental change. Ecology and Society, 12, pp. 9–27.
View
Web of Science®
Google Scholar
Janssen, M.A., Schoon, M.L., Ke, W. and Börner, K. (2006). Scholarly networks on resilience, vulnerability and adaptation within the human dimensions of global environmental change. Global Environmental Change, 16, pp. 240–252.
View
Web of Science®
Google Scholar
Johnson, N. and Elliott, D. (2011). Using social capital to organize for success? A case study of public–private interface in the UK Highways Agency. Policy and Society, 30, pp. 101–113.

View
Web of Science®
Google Scholar
Johnston, D., Becker, J. and Paton, D. (2012). Multi-agency community engagement during disaster recovery: lessons from two New Zealand earthquake events. Disaster Prevention and Management: An International Journal, 21, pp. 252–268.
View
Web of Science®
Google Scholar
Juettner, U. and Maklan, S. (2011). Supply chain resilience in the global financial crisis: an empirical study. Supply Chain Management: An International Journal, 16, pp. 246–259.
View
Web of Science®
Google Scholar
Kambhu, J., Weidman, S. and Krishnan, N. (2007). New directions for understanding systemic risk: a report on a conference cosponsored by the Federal Reserve Bank of New York and the National Academy of Sciences. Economic Policy Review, 13, pp. 1–83.
Google Scholar
Klein, R.J.T., Nicholls, R.J. and Thomalla, F. (2003). Resilience to natural hazards: how useful is this concept? Global Environmental Change, 5, pp. 35–45.
Google Scholar
Kleindorfer, P.R. and Saad, G.H. (2005). Managing disruption risks in supply chains. Production and Operations Management, 14, pp. 53–68.
View
Web of Science®
Google Scholar
Klibi, W., Martel, A. and Guitouni, A. (2010). The design of robust value-creating supply chain networks: a critical review. European Journal of Operational Research, 203, pp. 283–293.
View
Web of Science®
Google Scholar
Limnios, E.A.M., Mazzarol, T., Ghadouani, A. and Schilizzi, S.G. (2014). The resilience architecture framework: four organizational archetypes. European Management Journal, 32, pp. 104–116.
View

Web of Science®
Google Scholar
Linnenluecke, M. and Griffiths, A. (2010). Beyond adaptation: resilience for business in light of climate change and weather extremes. Business & Society, 49, p. 477.
View
Web of Science®
Google Scholar
Linnenluecke, M.K. and Griffiths, A. (2012). Assessing organizational resilience to climate and weather extremes: complexities and methodological pathways. Climatic Change, 113, pp. 933–947.
View
Web of Science®
Google Scholar
Linnenluecke, M.K. and Griffiths, A. (2013). The 2009 Victorian bushfires: a multilevel perspective on organizational risk and resilience. Organization & Environment, 26, pp. 386–411.
View
Web of Science®
Google Scholar
Luthans, F. (2002a). Positive organizational behavior: developing and managing psychological strengths. Academy of Management Executive, 16, pp. 57–72.
View
Web of Science®
Google Scholar
Luthans, F. (2002b). The need for and meaning of positive organizational behavior. Journal of Organizational Behavior, 23, pp. 695–706.
View
Web of Science®
Google Scholar
Luthans, F. and Youssef, C.M. (2007). Emerging positive organizational behavior. Journal of Management, 33, pp. 321–349.
View
Web of Science®
Google Scholar
Luthans, F., Avey, J.B. and Patera, J.L. (2008). Experimental analysis of a web-based training intervention to develop positive psychological capital. Academy of Management Learning & Education, 7, pp. 209–221.
View

Web of Science®
Google Scholar
Luthans, F., Avey, J.B., Avolio, B.J. and Peterson, S.J. (2010). The development and resulting performance impact of positive psychological capital. Human Resource Development Quarterly, 21, pp. 41–67.
View
Web of Science®
Google Scholar
Luthans, F., Avey, J.B., Avolio, B.J., Norman, S.M. and Combs, G.M. (2006). Psychological capital development: toward a micro-intervention. Journal of Organizational Behavior, 27, pp. 387–393.
View
Web of Science®
Google Scholar
Luthans, F., Avolio, B.J., Avey, J.B. and Norman, S.M. (2007). Positive psychological capital: measurement and relationship with performance and satisfaction. Personnel Psychology, 60, pp. 541–572.
View
Web of Science®
Google Scholar
Luthans, B.C., Luthans, K.W. and Avey, J.B. (2013). Building the leaders of tomorrow: the development of academic psychological capital. Journal of Leadership & Organizational Studies, 21, pp. 191–199.
View
Web of Science®
Google Scholar
MacLean, N. (1992). Young Men and Fire. Chicago, IL: University of Chicago Press.
View
Google Scholar
Manyena, S.B. (2006). The concept of resilience revisited. Disasters, 30, pp. 433–450.
View
PubMed
Web of Science®
Google Scholar
Memili, E., Welsh, D.H. and Luthans, F. (2013). Going beyond research on goal setting: a proposed role for organizational psychological capital of family firms. Entrepreneurship Theory and Practice, 37, pp. 1289–1296.

View
Web of Science®
Google Scholar
Meyer, A.D. (1982). Adapting to environmental jolts. Administrative Science Quarterly, 27, pp. 515–537.
View
CAS
PubMed
Web of Science®
Google Scholar
Pearson, C.M. and Clair, J.A. (1998). Reframing crisis management. Academy of Management Review, 23, pp. 59–76.
View
Web of Science®
Google Scholar
Perrow, C. (1984). Normal Accidents: Living with High-risk Technologies. New York, NY: Basic Books.
Google Scholar
Pettit, T.J., Fiksel, J. and Croxton, K.L. (2010). Ensuring supply chain resilience: development of a conceptual framework. Journal of Business Logistics, 31, pp. 1–21.
View
Web of Science®
Google Scholar
Ponomarov, S.Y. and Holcomb, M.C. (2009). Understanding the concept of supply chain resilience. International Journal of Logistics Management, 20, pp. 124–143.
View
Web of Science®
Google Scholar
Powley, E.H. (2009). Reclaiming resilience and safety: resilience activation in the critical period of crisis. Human Relations, 62, pp. 1289–1326.
View
Web of Science®
Google Scholar
Reichard, R.J., Dollwet, M. and Louw-Potgieter, J. (2014). Development of cross-cultural psychological capital and its relationship with cultural intelligence and ethnocentrism. Journal of Leadership & Organizational Studies, 21, pp. 150–164.

View
Web of Science®
Google Scholar
Rice, J.B. and Caniato, F. (2003). Building a secure and resilient supply network. Supply Chain Management Review, 7, pp. 22–30.
Google Scholar
Rinaldi, S.M., Peerenboom, J.P. and Kelly, T.K. (2001). Identifying, understanding, and analyzing critical infrastructure interdependencies. IEEE Control Systems Magazine, 21, pp. 11–25.
View
Web of Science®
Google Scholar
Roberts, K.H. (1990). Some characteristics of one type of high reliability organization. Organization Science, 1, pp. 160–176.
View
Web of Science®
Google Scholar
Rochlin, G.I. (1999). Safe operation as a social construct. Ergonomics, 42, pp. 1549–1560.
View
Web of Science®
Google Scholar
Rudolph, J.W. and Repenning, N.P. (2002). Disaster dynamics: understanding the role of quantity in organizational collapse. Administrative Science Quarterly, 47, pp. 1–30.
View
Web of Science®
Google Scholar
Seligman, M. (1998). Learned Optimism: How to Change Your Mind and Your Life. New York, NY: Pocket Books.
Google Scholar
Sheffi, Y. (2005). The Resilient Enterprise: Overcoming Vulnerability for Competitive Advantage. Cambridge, MA: MIT Press.
Google Scholar
Sheffi, Y. and Rice, J. (2005). A supply chain view of the resilient enterprise. MIT Sloan Management Review, 47, pp. 41–48.
Web of Science®
Google Scholar
Shin, J., Taylor, M.S. and Seo, M.G. (2012). Resources for change: the relationships of organizational inducements and psychological resilience

to employees' attitudes and behaviors toward organizational change. Academy of Management Journal, 55, pp. 727–748.
View
Web of Science®
Google Scholar
Shrivastava, P. (1994). Technological and organizational roots of industrial crises: lessons from Exxon Valdez and Bhopal. Technological Forecasting and Social Change, 45, pp. 237–253.
View
Web of Science®
Google Scholar
Shrivastava, P. (1995). Ecocentric management for a risk society. Academy of Management Review, 20, pp. 118–137.
View
Web of Science®
Google Scholar
Sitkin, S.B. (1992). Learning through failure: the strategy of small losses. Research in Organizational Behavior, 14, pp. 231–266.
Web of Science®
Google Scholar
Smart, P.K., Tranfield, D., Deasley, P., Levene, R., Rowe, A. and Corley, J. (2003). Integrating 'lean' and 'high reliability' thinking. Proceedings of the Institution of Mechanical Engineers, Part B: Journal of Engineering Manufacture, 217, pp. 733–739.
View
Web of Science®
Google Scholar
D. Smith and D. Elliott (eds) (2006). Key Readings in Crisis Management: Systems and Structures for Prevention and Recovery. London: Routledge.
Google Scholar
Staw, B.M., Sandelands, L.E. and Dutton, J.E. (1981). Threat rigidity effects in organizational behavior: a multilevel analysis. Administrative Science Quarterly, 26, pp. 501–524.
View
Web of Science®
Google Scholar
Sutcliffe, K.M. (2011). High reliability organizations (HROs). Clinical Anaesthesiology, 25, pp. 133–144.
PubMed
Google Scholar

Sutcliffe, K.M. and Vogus, T.J. (2003). Organizing for resilience. In K.S. Cameron, J.E. Dutton and R.E. Quinn (eds), Positive Organizational Scholarship: Foundations of a New Discipline. San Francisco, CA: Berrett-Koehler.
Google Scholar
Taleb, N.N. (2011). Antifragility – or – The property of disorder-loving systems. Available at: http://www.edge.org/q2011/q11_3.html#taleb (accessed 31 August 2014).
Google Scholar
Urciuoli, L., Mohanty, S., Hintsa, J. and Gerine Boekesteijn, E. (2014). The resilience of energy supply chains: a multiple case study approach on oil and gas supply chains to Europe. Supply Chain Management: An International Journal, 19, pp. 46–63.
View
Web of Science®
Google Scholar
Van Den Eede, G., Van de Walle, B. and Rutkowski, A. (2006). Dealing with risk in incident management: an application of high reliability theory. In HICSS'06 2006. Proceedings of the 39th Annual Hawaii International Conference on System Sciences, Vol. 2. Piscataway, NJ, IEEE, p. 37c.
View
Google Scholar
Van Eck, N.J. and Waltman, L. (2014). Visualizing bibliometric networks. In Y. Ding, R. Rousseau and D. Wolfram (eds), Measuring Scholarly Impact. Cham, Switzerland: Springer, pp. 285–320.
View
Google Scholar
Vogus, T.J. and Sutcliffe, K.M. (2007). Organizational resilience: towards a theory and research agenda. Paper presented at the IEEE International Conference on Systems, Man and Cybernetics.
Google Scholar
Voss, M.D. and Williams, Z. (2013). Public–private partnerships and supply chain security: C-TPAT as an indicator of relational security. Journal of Business Logistics, 34, pp. 320–334.
View
Web of Science®
Google Scholar

Wagnild, G.M. and Young, H.M. (1993). Development and psychometric evaluation of the Resilience Scale. Journal of Nursing Measurement, 1, pp. 165–178.
CAS
PubMed
Google Scholar
Wang, J., Cooke, F.L. and Huang, W. (2014). How resilient is the (future) workforce in China? A study of the banking sector and implications for human resource development. Asia Pacific Journal of Human Resources, 52, pp. 132–154.
View
Web of Science®
Google Scholar
Wedawatta, G. and Ingirige, B. (2012). Resilience and adaptation of small and medium-sized enterprises to flood risk. Disaster Prevention and Management: An International Journal, 21, pp. 474–488.
View
Web of Science®
Google Scholar
Weick, K.E. (1993). The collapse of sensemaking in organizations: the Mann Gulch disaster. Administrative Science Quarterly, 38, pp. 628–652.
View
Web of Science®
Google Scholar
Weick, K.E. and Roberts, K.H. (1993). Collective mind in organizations: heedful interrelating on flight decks. Administrative Science Quarterly, 38, pp. 357–381.
View
Web of Science®
Google Scholar
Weick, K.E. and Sutcliffe, K.M. (2001). Managing the Unexpected. San Francisco, CA: Jossey-Bass.
Google Scholar
Weick, K.E., Sutcliffe, K.M. and Obstfeld, D. (1999). Organizing for high reliability: processes of collective mindfulness. Research in Organizational Behavior, 21, pp. 81–124.
Web of Science®
Google Scholar
Wieland, A. and Wallenburg, M.C. (2013). The influence of relational competencies on supply chain resilience: a relational view. International

Journal of Physical Distribution & Logistics Management, 43, pp. 300–320.
View
Web of Science®
Google Scholar
Wildavsky, A.B. (1988). Searching for Safety. Piscataway, NJ: Transaction Publishers.
Google Scholar
Winn, M.I. and Pogutz, S. (2013). Business, ecosystems, and biodiversity: new horizons for management research. Organization & Environment, 26, pp. 203–229.
View
Web of Science®
Google Scholar
Winston, A. (2014). Resilience in a hotter world. Harvard Business Review, 92, pp. 56–64.
PubMed
Web of Science®
Google Scholar
Xavier, W.G., Bandeira-de-Mello, R. and Marcon, R. (2014). Institutional environment and Business Groups' resilience in Brazil. Journal of Business Research, 67, pp. 900–907.
View
Web of Science®
Google Scholar
Youssef, C.M. and Luthans, F. (2007). Positive organizational behavior in the workplace: the impact of hope, optimism, and resilience. Journal of Management, 33, pp. 774–800.
View
Web of Science®
Google Scholar
Zoback, M.L. (2014). 'Epicenters' of resilience. Science, 346, pp. 283–283.
View
CAS
PubMed
Web of Science®
Google Scholar